

COUNCIL FOR DEVELOPMENT AND RECONSTRUCTION
CULTURAL HERITAGE AND URBAN DEVELOPMENT
PROJECT MANAGEMENT UNIT

Resettlement Report for the residents of Salameh Building

March 2011

The objective of the resettlement plan for the residents of Salameh Building is to provide current residents with improved living conditions whilst allowing the municipality to use a space from the building and transform it into a municipal center to serve the city.

How the building was chosen to be restored?

On the phase 1 of the CHUD project in Saida, on June 2006, a survey of the buildings along the touristic Path in Saida and in Bab El-Serail was prepared by the consultant to be restored under this phase.

Some of these buildings had minor damages which are not critical, others have not been designed for their strengthening and doesn't have budget.

Other 5 buildings were within the area of the works but were not part of the original package, and the consultant suggested including them in the project.

Some buildings were heavily deteriorated and damaged. These buildings, unless substantial strengthening works are carried out, restoring their facades will not be appropriate. Among the building which needed an urgent intervention was the Salameh Building.

The building consist of three storey built with stone masonry faced with plaster. The building had several disorders: Cracks on the south facades and some interior walls, cracks in the interior arches, swelling to the outside in the south and east façade walls. Since that the status of the building was dangerous and needed an urgent action in structural strengthening which required a deeper studies and higher budget. The restoration was shifted to the phase 2 of the project.

The building was constructed by Hussein Salameh. His wife Amneh Ghandour still leaves alone in her own apartment (her daughter stays visit her on the weekend) while that his sister Afifeh Salameh leaves with her niece leaves in the upper floor.

The building was structurally unstable. The condition of the agreement of the World Bank and CDR with the municipality consisted of developing a cost sharing scheme whereby the occupants of the building share part of the cost with the municipality by converting the ground floor (for example) to community activities.

For restoring the building from the public money, the municipality started negotiating the 2 families Salameh and Soufan to convert a part of the building to the community.

History of the steps taken by the municipality to reach an agreement:

On August 27, 2008 the previous mayor of Saida Dr.Bizri, by it's letter reference 11612/M.R. asked the CDR to consider:

- Funding the rent of 2 apartments
- Making a detailed survey for the building
- Consolidating the building of Salameh and secure the building
- Preparing a detailed design for the restoration with an estimation budget
- Take the right decision to restore or demolition of the building depending on the cost.

The CDR replied by it's letter dated September 19, 2008 stating that after several meeting with the CHUD team and the World Bank mission, the agreement with the municipality of Saida was that the Bank will finance the restoration of the whole building, in condition that the municipality will

- Negotiate with the occupants to reach an agreement on converting a part of the space for the community use.
- Will share in the cost of the restoration of the two buildings
- Will provide the rent cost for the residents during the execution of the restoration.

In the same reply, the CDR insisting on that the safety and the public security is the municipality responsibility, and suggested that the municipality take the necessary to provide the safety of the occupants of these 2 buildings meanwhile the consultants will prepare the complete restoration and consolidation documents.

On march 17, 2009 the previous mayor of Saida sent a letter to CDR (CDR reference 3504/MR) to inform officially CDR that a part of Salameh building was demolished and that the municipality assure to cover the social support including the resettlement allowance to the residents and it's part of funding the restoration of Salameh building. The mayor urged the CDR to take quick action to reinforce the building and proceed to its restoration.



Fig1. Salameh building after the demolition



Fig2. Salameh building after consolidation

On May 21, 2009 the previous mayor of Saida sent a letter to CDR (CDR reference 6737/MR) to inform CDR that the municipality has accomplished its duties concerning the residents of Salameh building by providing them rent allowance for one year.

The CDR by its fax (reference 4172/1 dated March 23, 2009) reply by assuring that the restoration will be under the second phase of the CHUD project in Saida.

The building was structurally unstable. The condition of the agreement with the municipality consisted of developing a cost sharing scheme whereby the occupants of the building share part of the cost with the municipality by converting the ground floor (for example) to community activities.

On December 20, 2010 the mayor of Saida sent a letter to CDR (CDR reference 15787/MR) stating that the municipality is incapable to carry the conditions of the World Bank after its failure to reach an agreement with the owners of Salameh building, and suggest to substitute the fund for restoration to restore paths in the old city which will affect positively the heritage of the old city.(drawings were attached to the letter).

The municipality and the PMU started to search for a similar project in the old city. Different suggestions were discussed.

On January 17, 2011 the mayor of Saida sent a letter to CDR (CDR reference 51/2011/ F) assuring that the municipality will ensure providing the resettled 2 families rent allowance until finding another funds to restore the building.

The negotiation restarted again after the acceptance of Mr. Mohamad Soufan, owner of the patio and the lower level, to convert a part of his ownership to public use (in addition, he owns the first floor). An agreement was signed on that the last flat will not be demolished and the hall and one room in the ground floor will be dedicated to the municipal affairs in charge of the old city. (see attachment contract)

A. Identification of project impacts and affected populations:

Project Alternatives and mechanisms for minimizing resettlement: After demolition of a part of the building, it was impossible to avoid the need for resettlement for safety reason for people living in the building. After restoring the building the residents will be able to reallocate to their apartments.

The municipality of Saida prepared the census for the resident of Salameh building which didn't change over the last years after the demolition of a part of the building.

Criteria for eligibility: Persons occupying the project area after the cutoff date are not eligible for compensation and/or resettlement assistance.

The building consists of 5 parts:

- The division 144 is the basement composed by a shop and a stair is owned by Ali Soufan and Abdallah Soufan sons: Mohamad, Fatima, Zainab, and Zahra.
- The division 145 of the first floor is owned by Ali Soufan and Abdallah Soufan sons: Mohamad, Fatima, Zainab, and Zahra.
- The division 10 of the first floor is owned by Hussein Salameh and is occupied by his wife Amneh Ghandour.
- The division 11 of the first floor is owned by Hussein Salameh and is occupied by his niece Tamama Fatah .
- The division 146 of the second floor is owned by Hussein Salameh and is occupied sister Afifeh Salameh.

Since that Support should be provided only to people who are physically displaced by the project, only Amneh Ghandour, Afifeh Salameh were eligible for rent compensation

given that the family Soufan left the building since years and Tamama was practically living in the same apartment with her aunt Afifeh.

Vulnerable Groups: The three women can be counted as vulnerable; they don't have any other assets and are currently surviving on generosity from the sons of Amneh. Two of them are widows while Tamama is mute.

B. Institutional, Legal and compensation framework:

The key institutions involved in the resettlement of the 3 ladies are 1) the Municipality of Saida; and 2) the Council for Development and Reconstruction (CDR).

Expropriation: Since the owners of the structure will be settle back to their properties, no expropriation will take place. The place that will be used by the municipality will be the counterpart of the owners participation to restore the building.

On the 12th of March 2009, after the demolition of a part of the Building the municipality had an emergency meeting and decided to offer a financial assistance to the family of Hussein Salameh Family represented by his wife Amneh Ghandour and his sister Afifeh Salameh, consisted of a sum of 12,000,000 L.L. (=8000\$) (Municipal decision 80). Similar board decisions 59 and 24 dated respectively 3 March 2010 and 19 January 2011 were issued for the extended assistance.

The part of each lady is 4000\$ per year which is a significant value; each of them can rent an apartment of the same area as their apartments in a nice district of the new city. The ladies preferred to move to their relative houses and benefit from the rent allowance to assist their families.

The two compensated ladies Amneh Ghandour and Afifeh Salameh received till date a total 12,000,000 L.L (=8000\$) each as rent compensation for the last two years (see the attached 3rd invoice prepared by the municipality for the year 2011). The third allowances covered by the municipal decision 24 dated 19 January 2011 will be paid after releasing it from the financial department of the municipality.

The municipality of Saida guaranteed to pay this allowance until the ladies are resettled to their apartments by its letter to the CDR (CDR reference 51/2011/ F) dated 17 January 2011.

No loss of income result from displacement of the ladies, since that the old ladies were receiving allowances from their families. At the contrary, their relative are profiting from their

rent allowances and the two sons of Amneh are released from the monthly expenses to their mother and aunts.

On the 11th of March 2011, the CDR received officially a copy of the contract signed by the municipality represented by the vice mayor and the owners of the Salameh building represented by Mohamad Soufan and Afif Salame. (He had written legalized authorization from them to sign the contract).

The CHUD team suggested to the municipality to offer transport assistance to Mr. Salameh who stated that he is an inspector in the municipality and that he have a group of workers that will assist him.

C. Implementation schedule:

Until the completion of the restoration of the building, Amneh Ghandour was resettled to her married daughter house in Ghazieh (village at the south eastern of Saida).

She's using her rent allowance as a family assistance to her daughter. These days she's staying with her second daughter who delivered a baby to help her. (She couldn't come to the information meeting for this reason)

Afifeh Salameh and her niece Tamama Fatah are resettled to the house of Tamama's sister, in the same district of the Salameh building. Tamama is taking care of her sister baby while Afifeh is helping in the allowances her niece family from the sum she received from the municipality.

On the 11th of March 2011, the CDR received officially a copy of the contract signed by the municipality and the owners.

The CDR informed the contractor about the agreement. A meeting was fixed on the 16 of March 2011 to discuss with the consultant and the contractor the schedule of works prior to start the restoration of the building.

Mr. Afif Salameh will be notified of the day of commencement of works (as per his request). He wants to be present when the contractor cleans the building to carry the remaining furniture and possessions of the ladies. (It was forbidden to enter the building after the demolishing for safety reasons, the ladies took their important stuff only).

The contractor of the second phase in Saida "GENECO" will then start the restoration of the building with a cost of 250,000\$. He will send to CDR a detailed workplan approved by the consultant after inspection of the condition of the building , but as a first assessment, the contractor stated verbally that he will need 6 to 8 months to deliver the works.

If the restoration of the building is completed before the completion of the works in the contract actor agreement, CDR will choose a separate taking over of the building to accelerate the resettlement of the residents to their homes.

Timetable

The project will be implemented according to the following timeline:

Action	Agency	Expected /Completion Date
Demolition of a part of the building	-	12 March 2009
Paying Rent allowances to resettled ladies	Municipality of Saida	Yearly until relocation to the restored building
Consultations prior to agreement	Municipality of Saida PMU	Continuously 4 February 2011
Information meeting with owners prior to start the works	Municipality / PMU	4 March 2011
Signature of Agreement	Municipality of Saida	11 March 2011
Launching the works	CDR/ Contractor	1st April 2011
Continuous follow up with the owners / resettled ladies	Municipality / PMU	Periodically until relocation to the building
Taking over of the building	CDR/ Saida Municipality	October 2011
Relocation to the Building	PMU/Saida Municipality	November 2011

Budget

The project is estimated to cost 215,000 dollars. Of this 80% is to be financed through the World Bank and 20% through the municipality.

D. Framework for public consultation and participation

This project is a result of a long series of meetings and consultations that have taken place over the past two years between the World Bank, the CDR, the municipality of Saida and the stakeholders of the Salameh Building.

Several forms of meeting were held with the targeted beneficiaries of the restoration of the Salameh building.

- The municipality was the responsible of negotiating the 2 Salameh families Soufan and Salameh on converting a part of the building to the community. During these meetings, the municipality informed the owners about all the steps of the projects. The CHUD

team urged the municipality to relieve the anxiety of the owners and to proof its involvement of the municipality.

- Knowing that Mr. Afif Salameh is an inspector in the municipality and he was following closely all the details.
- A **visit** was conducted to Saida and Ghazieh (village at the south eastern of Saida) to meet the resettled three ladies on the 4th of February 2011 by Hala Deghaili from the CHUD team and Zeina Khalil from the world bank (Beirut office) to verify that these 2 ladies are receiving the rent allowances from the municipality and to assure that the social safeguard are respected and to ensure that these ladies are personally informed by all the details. The visit was very friendly; Answers were given to their concerns.

By the end of the visits, Mr Afif Salameh asked for a meeting in the municipality to discuss the following step as soon as possible.

The CHUD team preferred waiting that the contract between the municipality and the owner is signed before discussing the next step with the stakeholders.

- An **information meeting** was then held on the 4th of March 2011 by the CHUD team with the occupants of the building and the presence of the municipality. (for details refer to the Consultation meeting report)

The aim of the meeting was to assure that all concerned parties are aware of their roles and the restoration steps and schedules.

Mr Mohamad Soufan represented Soufan Family and Mr Afif Salameh represented his mother and his aunts.

- The PMU team is planning to have continuous meetings with the owners when needed to succeed a pilot project of restoration of a historical house in the old city and to respond to any complain or question raised by stakeholders.

E. Institutional Responsibility for Implementation and appeal

The key institutions involved in the implementation and procedures for grievance redress are 1) the municipality of Saida; and 2) the PMU representing the (CDR).

The municipality is in charge of implementing the project.

A committee composed of the Municipal Engineer, two municipal members, the social expert in the PMU and one representative of each of the two families owning the building will be

charged of coordinating the project and acting as a liaison between the tenants and municipal authorities. All appeals are to be conveyed through this committee to the municipal board.

Monitoring Arrangements

The municipality, which is responsible for the resettlement process, has conducted the first census of the current residential tenants of the building.

The PMU will summarize information and agreements and monitor the process of resettlement and the award of compensation, and will be made available to the Bank.